

EVALUATION REPORT

Request for Proposals for the Provision of Engineering Management Consultant Services for the Borough of Tenafly, County of Bergen, State of New Jersey

Prepared for: Borough of Tenafly

By: Borough of Tenafly Evaluation Team

Dated: November 11, 2022

Evaluation Report Table of Contents

<u>Report Sections</u>	<u>Page</u>
Executive Summary	2
1. Summary of Benefits	3
2. Overview of the RFP	4
3. Form of Proposals and Required Forms	5
4. Evaluation Process	6
5. Proposals in Response to RFP	6
6. Proposal Evaluation Matrix	9
7. Recommendation – Successful Respondent	11
<u>Attachments</u>	
Evaluation Matrix	Att. 1

Executive Summary

This Evaluation Report is being provided pursuant to and in accordance with the requirements of the competitive contracting provisions of the Local Public Contracts Law (N.J.S.A. 40A:11-4.1etseq.).The purpose of this Evaluation Report is to provide the Council of the Borough of Tenafly (“Borough”) with an evaluation of the proposals received in response to a Request for Proposals issued by the Borough, and to provide a recommendation to the Borough Council of a Respondent for the award of a contract (the “Successful Respondent”).

The goal of the Borough in utilizing the competitive contracting process is to obtain proposals from qualified, multi-disciplinary engineering consultant firms with considerable experience in the study, design, implementation and construction management of transportation projects focused on pedestrian safety to assist with the strategic implementation of the Downtown Revitalization Plan. More specifically, to conduct “The Piermont Corridor Study” and look at the interrelated projects to develop a holistic plan for the Piermont Road Corridor which includes intersection improvements and designs for the bus stop area and concepts for Huyler park (the “Services”). This holistic planis to include concept plans and cost estimates for the roadway and signal improvements contemplated so that the Borough is in a position to act on discrete projects once Services are complete. The proposed term of the Contract for the Services is for no more thanfour years terminating on December 31, 2026.

On August 19, 2022, the Borough issued a Request for Proposals (“RFP”) to solicit Proposals for the provision of Services, as more particularly described herein, pursuant the competitive contracting provisions of the Local Public Contracts Law, N.J.S.A. 40A:11-1 et seq, and authorized by Resolution #R22-162 adopted on May 10, 2022. Through this competitive contracting process, the Borough seeks to enter into a contract with a qualified firm to implement the in a reliable, knowledgeable and cost-effective manner.

Services are expected to be performed in compliance with all federal, state and local requirements, laws, rules and regulations, and in accordance with the terms and provisions of the Contract, the terms and provisions of the RFP and in accordance with prudent industry practice. The Borough anticipates cooperating in good faith with the Successful Respondent to facilitate the performance of the obligations set forth in the RFP.

To evaluate Proposals, the Borough organized an evaluation team comprised of Jimmy Homs, Borough Administrator, Council Person Adam Michaels, Downtown Revitalization Committee Members Daniel Zausner and David Jang, and Borough Attorney Wendy Rubinstein Quiroga Esq., of the Weiner Law Group, LLP (collectively, the “Evaluation Team”).

The procurement and evaluation process were undertaken in accordance with the competitive contracting provisions of the Local Public Contracts Law, and all other applicable law. On September 14, 2022, the Borough opened four (4) Proposals in response to the RFP. The Proposals were submitted by Boswell Engineering, Bright View Engineering, LLC, Neglia Group and Remington & Vernick Engineers.

The Evaluation Team conducted a comprehensive evaluation of the Proposals based upon qualifications, experience, approach, knowledge of the Borough, price and other factors, as set forth in detail in this Evaluation Report, in accordance with competitive contracting provisions of the Local Public Contracts Law and other applicable law. The evaluation of the Proposals were conducted in accordance with an evaluation matrix ("Evaluation Matrix"), that is based on a total potential score of 100. The following criteria and weighting factors were utilized:

1. Ability to meet the objectives of the Borough as described in the scope of work, staffing and proposal requirements (25%)
2. Experience with implementation of corridor enhancement projects. (25%)
3. Familiarity with the Borough of Tenafly. (25%)
4. General experience of the firm and qualifications of the primary principal and support staff. (15%)
5. Fee structure. (10%)

Based on the information and analysis set forth in this Report, the Evaluation Team recommends the Borough Council award the contract with the Borough for the provision of Engineering Management Consultant Services to conduct "The Piermont Corridor Study" and to develop a holistic plan for the Piermont Road Corridor which includes intersection improvements and designs for the bus stop area and concepts for Huyler park (the "Services") to Bright View Engineering.

Summary of Benefits

As noted above, the objective of the Borough's RFPs is to contract with a qualified, multi-disciplinary engineering consultant firm capable of providing engineering management consultant services, pursuant to a contract terminating no later than December 31, 2026.

All of the Proposals received by the Borough will allow it to develop a holistic improvement of the traffic movements in the Borough's downtown, increase

pedestrian safety and provide for intersection improvements within the Piermont Road Corridor.

Overview of the RFP

The RFP solicited Proposals for the performance of Services pursuant to a Contract to be entered into by and between the Borough and the Successful Respondent. The RFP provided that the Successful Respondent will have expertise in providing Engineering Management Consulting Services, and must demonstrate that they will have the continuing capabilities to perform the Piermont Corridor Study and look at the following interrelated projects within the Tenafly Downtown area to determine feasibility, cost estimates, and concept plans so that the Borough is in a position to act on discrete projects once the study is complete. Some of the projects (i.e. upgrading intersections) could be high cost items, the exact magnitude of which would require further study. Therefore, it is necessary to complete this Corridor Study first so that the Borough has a clearer picture before implementing any proposed project. More specifically, the scope of work includes the following:

- 1 Traffic Counts and Modeling of Traffic Patterns to include:
 - a. Traffic counts at 14 intersections;
 - b. Development of an existing condition model (Synchro);
 - c. Development of three (3) future model scenarios;
 - d. Crash analysis is recommended within the study area to assess type and severity of crashes; and
 - e. Preparation of traffic report and summary of finding.

- 2 Improvement and Upgrades for Identified Intersections:
 - a. Investigate the need for a fully-signalized intersection at East Clinton and Dean Street/ Signal warrant study;
 - b. Conceptualize plans and cost estimates for improvements at three intersections along County Road and an additional intersection of Dean Street and East Clinton; and
 - c. Provide recommendations and cost estimates of potential sidewalk upgrades for the surrounding intersections.

- 3 Study Potential Closure of Piermont Road at Huyler Park/West: including cost estimates and a concept plan for closure of the intersection including proposed signal timings and infrastructure improvements which may include a new signal for cars exiting the parking area and removal of the signal from the Piermont Road approach.

- 4 Study Potential Closure of Piermont Road at Bus Stop:

-
-
- a. Study the potential to close the bus stop area to vehicular traffic and rework the newly created plaza with an improved bus stop and other downtown amenities;
 - b. Identify necessary roadway and signal changes; and
 - c. Prepare engineering drawings along with cost estimates for implementation.

5 Conversion of Piermont Road to Two-Way Traffic:

- a. Study potential to convert Piermont Road north of Riveredge Road to two-way operation;
- b. Conduct traffic impact analysis;
- c. Provide recommendations for traffic controls at Piermont Road and West Railroad Avenue; and
- d. Provide cost estimates for bump-outs to make crossings safer.

6 Riveredge Road Mobility Enhancements:

- a. Study both short- and long-term solutions to make the stretch of Riveredge Road from Jefferson Avenue to West Railroad Avenue safer for all users;
- b. Concepts and cost estimates for pedestrian crossing enhancements;
- c. Concepts and cost estimates for bicycle safety enhancements; and
- d. Concepts and cost estimates for redesign of road to accommodate new features.

The RFP also provides that the Successful Respondent and the Borough will enter into a Contract for four (4) years, terminating on December 31, 2026. Pursuant to the terms of the RFP, the Successful Respondent must be prepared to execute and deliver to the Borough a form of agreement acceptable to the Township, in its sole discretion, within ten (10) days of its presentation. Moreover, subcontracting and/or assignment of any portion of the Services to be provided un the terms of the RPP are strictly prohibited without prior written consent of the Borough, in its sole discretion.

Form of Proposals and Required Forms

Proposals were required to include the following information about each Respondent:

- General Information
- Administrative Information
- Professional Information, including experience and qualifications

Proposals were also required to include the following:

-
- Letter of Qualification
 - Affirmative Action Compliance
 - Letter of Intent
 - Ownership Disclosure Statement
 - Contribution Statement
 - Non-Collusion Affidavit
 - Acknowledgement of Receipt of Addenda
 - Mandatory EEO Language
 - Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran
 - Fee Proposal
 - Executive Summary
 - All Additional Administrative/Professional Information
 - Proposal Checklist

Evaluation Process

To evaluate the Proposals, the Township organized the Evaluation Team and developed an Evaluation Matrix prior to the issuance of the RFP. The evaluation of the Proposals involved a three-part process:

- The first part consisted of a review of the documents submitted with each Proposal to determine if the Respondent included all documentation and information in its Proposal required by the RFP. Once all submittal requirements have been satisfied, a Respondent qualifies for the second phase of the evaluation process.
- The second part of the process included interviews with representatives from each of the Respondents.
- The third part entailed a weighted rating of the value provided by the Proposal across several categories (ability to meet objectives, Respondent experience with representation of governmental entities, Respondent familiarity with the Township, general experience and qualifications, and cost) and evaluation of factors within those categories.

The Respondent with the top ranking in the third part of the evaluation process is then recommended for award of a contract as the Successful Respondent.

Proposal in Response to the RFP

The following is a brief summary of the Proposal from each of the remaining Respondents:

1. Boswell Engineering ("Boswell")

Boswell, founded in 1924 is headquartered in South Hackensack, New Jersey. With over 200 employees and expertise in planning and traffic and transportation engineering, Boswell has the requisite staff and knowledge to provide the engineering management consultant services requested in the RFP.

The proposed Boswell team assembled to provide Engineering Management Consultant Services to the Borough is led by Frank Dobiszewski, P.E., PTOE, IMSA III. Mr. Dobiszewski has more than 35 years of traffic and transportation engineering experience in planning, design and construction of intersection improvements projects throughout northern New Jersey and has also written design guides and manuals pertaining to traffic signal design, installation, and maintenance of signal systems for the Institute of Transportation Engineers and the International Municipal Signal Association. In addition to Mr. Dobiszewski, Boswell's team includes additional support staff to conduct traffic counts, traffic modeling, traffic reports and studies, as well as an engineering team to develop the engineering design/conceptual plans and estimates. Some of Boswell's representative, local clients include Township of Washington, Westwood, Closter and Ridgely Park. Boswell also previously provided consulting engineering services to the Borough of Tenafly for the Washington Street Downtown Revitalization Project – Phase II.

Boswell proposes to meet the objectives described in the RFP by conducting a comprehensive roadway safety audit and utilization of the Federal Highway Administration's (FHWA) Proven Safety Countermeasure Tools; and by evaluating the entire study area for crash type, severity, and causal factors using the New Jersey Safety Voyager platform developed in conjunction with FHWA for crash analysis. Boswell proposes to utilize the services of New Jersey Traffic Data to perform the traffic counts at the identified intersections and then utilize the data to develop the Synchro networks for existing, future, and "what-if" scenarios that need to be performed and evaluated for selecting the best design alternative. Boswell proposes a total project fee of \$147,010.00 for all services set forth in its response.

2. Bright View Engineering ("Bright View")

Bright View, located in Livingston, New Jersey, provides engineering and planning on call services to numerous public clients. Bright View's staff has all the needed professional licensure and availability to provide the Borough with the requested Services.

If selected, Bright View's project team will be led by Joseph A. Fishinger, Jr., PE, PP, PTOE. Mr. Fishinger has 25 years of experience in traffic engineering and transportation planning and is well versed in similar projects for municipalities

and counties. Mr. Fishinger was also involved with the initial project visioning for the Piermont Road area during his previous tenure at NV5, Inc. To assist Bright View in achieving the goals of the Services, Bright View is partnering with BFJ Planning, which prepared the Tenafly Downtown Revitalization Plan. BFJ Planning is a consulting firm providing professional expertise in planning and related fields since its establishment in 1980. Bright View's team includes additional support staff to conduct traffic analysis, data collection, project outreach, conceptual plans and cost estimates. Some of Bright View's local clients include the City of Hoboken, Montvale, Ridgewood, Westwood and Northvale.

To complete the Scope of Work identified in the RFP, Bright View proposes the following tasks. To initiate the Services and fulfill the goals of the Borough and to coordinate potential revisions in the Borough's goals as the Piermont Corridor Study is completed, Bright View proposes a series of progress meetings to allow for fluidity in the design and execution of the Services. These meetings would occur at the kickoff, after initial findings, additional revisions after receipt of comments and upon completion of the draft report. Additionally, Bright View will perform traffic counts for the requested intersections, perform an existing conditions analysis, analysis of potential improvements as compared to the existing and no-build models to determine the likely effect on the study area, prepare the conceptual improvement plans, conduct public outreach as needed and ultimately produce a final report that will include recommended next steps towards implementation and potential funding sources to assist the Borough with final design and construction costs. Bright View proposes a total project fee of \$205,540.00 for all services set forth in its response.

3. NegliaGroup ("Neglia")

Neglia, founded in 1948 provides planning, engineering, landscape architecture, land surveying and construction administration services to State agencies, counties, municipalities and public and private clients. Neglia has the requisite staff and knowledge to provide the engineering management consultant services requested in the RFP and also notes that they have a demonstrated proficiency for developing an idea and making it a reality in the most thorough and cost-effective way.

The proposed team assembled to provide Engineering Management Consultant Services to the Borough is led by Brian A. Intindola, P.E., P.P., C.M.E., C.P.W.M. Mr. Intindola has more than 26 years of experience in traffic engineering, design and construction management of transit, traffic, and site access projects. He has successfully managed construction projects with values of \$900.00 to \$7 Million since he joined Neglia in 2006. In addition to Mr. Intindola, Neglia's management team includes David Juzmeski, P.E., P.P. and Gary A. Veenstra, P.L.S., C.F.S. In

the case of further staffing needs, Neglia will provide the additional support staff needed to complete the Services. Some of Neglia's representative, local clients include Dumont, Oradell, Maywood, Hackensack, Bogota and additional Bergen County municipalities.

Neglia identifies the Borough's needs to provide public infrastructure in a state of good repair to service its residents and seeks to serve the Borough by performing engineering tasks that keeps the infrastructure on-line and replacing and improving infrastructure as needed. Neglia proposes a total project fee of \$218,000.00 to provide the Services requested in the Borough's RFP.

4. Remington & Vernick Engineers ("RVE")

RVE's traffic engineering team, headquartered in Cherry Hill, New Jersey, provides a full suite of professional traffic engineering services, including the evaluation and design of traffic signal systems, intersection geometry, the preparation and review of traffic impact statements, traffic control, signage, striping and trip generation support of Land Use Planning. RVE has been providing municipal representation and management since their founding in 1901. With more than 400 professionals, RVE has sufficient staff with the requisite professional licensure to provide the Borough with the requested Services.

If selected, RVE's project team will be led by Derrick Kennedy, PE,PTP. Mr. Kennedy has 30 years of engineering experience and his areas of expertise include traffic design, transportation planning, corridor optimization, parking studies, accident analyses and traffic impact studies. RVE also identified additional personnel who will be available with their particular skills and experience as needed. Some of RVE's municipal references include Guttenberg, Margate, New Brunswick Hasbrouck Heights, Fort Lee and Bergenfield.

To complete the Scope of Work identified in the RFP, RVE proposes the following tasks: 1. To confirm and identify transportation and land use issues, opportunities and constraints; 2. Identify transportation issues and opportunities; and 3. Identify potential solutions and develop conceptual plans. It is anticipated that the report and plans will provide the information necessary for the Borough to plan for the future improvements to the identified locations. RVE proposes a total project fee of \$134,752.00 for all services set forth in its response.

Proposal Evaluation Matrix

Each of the four Proposals were evaluated in accordance with the process defined in the RFP. The evaluation was conducted pursuant to the Evaluation

Matrix, which is based on a total potential score of 100. The Evaluation Matrix is broken into the following criteria and weighting factors

1. Ability to meet the objectives of the Borough as described in the scope of work, staffing and proposal requirements (25%)
2. Experience with implementation of corridor enhancement projects. (25%)
3. Familiarity with the Borough of Tenafly. (25%)
4. General experience of the firm and qualifications of the primary principal and support staff. (15%)
5. Fee structure. (10%)

The Evaluation Matrix scoring is provided in **Attachment 1**. The following sections of this Evaluation Report provide a review of the evaluation criteria with respect to the Proposals received.

A. Ability to meet the objectives of the Borough as described in the scope of work, staffing and proposal requirements

All Respondents demonstrated that they clearly understood the Borough's goals and objectives regarding the provision of Engineering Management Consultant Services. The Proposals all met the minimum standards and substantially addressed the requirements of the RFP, including that Respondent possessed the necessary experience in performing Services like those sought by the Borough. Bright View and RVE provided an explanation of tasks to be taken in order to meet the objectives of the RFP scope of work. Boswell also provided a description of services to be rendered to effectuate the Borough goals. Neglia provided assurances of its abilities to complete the scope of work.

All Respondents identified a Project Manager. Bright View provided resumes of key personnel. RVE and Boswell provided an organizational staffing chart and resumes for key personnel. Neglia also identified the lead and supporting staff as well as resumes for key personnel. All Respondents met the minimum requirements in this evaluation criterion.

B. Experience with implementation of corridor enhancement projects.

The Respondents all provided examples of experience representing governmental entities. RVE had less experience in Bergen County but identified projects in other Counties, such as Atlantic and Hudson Counties, that were similar in nature. Several of the Respondents participated in different elements of the same projects, such as the Kinderkamack Road project in Emerson, and road improvement in Hackensack. The proposed Project Manager for Bright View has substantial traffic engineering and corridor project experience while serving as Traffic Engineer for several municipalities of project and as the Traffic Engineer for Somerset County. Neglia provided examples of featured work, including appointments as Traffic Engineer for municipalities, within the resumes of its professionals.

C. Familiarity with the Borough of Tenafly

Due to its partnership with BFJ Planning, Bright View exhibited the most familiarity with the Borough. Boswell also previously provided consulting engineering services to the Borough of Tenafly for the Washington Street Downtown Revitalization Project – Phase II. Neglia and RVE both exhibited sufficient familiarity with the Borough and the project area.

D. General experience of the firm and qualifications of the primary principal and support staff

All Respondents have qualified principals and project managers. but may be distinguished by the experience of the proposed project team and firm experience/tenure.

E. Fee Structure

Respondents were required to provide in their Proposals a fee structure and total Services cost. Boswell proposes a total project fee of \$147,010.00 for all services set forth in its response. Bright View proposes a total project fee of \$205,540.00 for all services set forth in its response. Neglia proposes a total project fee of \$218,000.00 to provide the Services requested in the Borough's RFP. RVE proposes a total project fee of \$134,752.00 for all services set forth in its response.

Recommendation – Successful Respondent

In recommending that a Contract be awarded to Bright View as the Successful Respondent, the Evaluation Team reviewed all of the Proposals for legal compliance, as well as technical, experience, qualifications, knowledge and fee structure requirements set forth by the RFP.

Bright View's Proposal averaged 83.8 points out of a possible 100 points on the Evaluation Matrix. The Evaluation Team believes that Bright View has assembled a quality project team with the experience and technical capability, and knowledge and wherewithal to work as a partner with the Borough to efficiently and effectively provide the Scope of Work for Engineering Management Consultant Services sought under the RFP.

Accordingly, the Evaluation Team recommends that the Borough Council of the Borough of Tenafly award a contract to Bright View for the performance of the Services.

Attachment 1 - Proposal Evaluation Matrix

Evaluation Criteria	Weighting	Evaluation Matrix Average Evaluation Team Scoring			
		Average Respondent Scoring by Evaluation Team			
		Boswell	Bright View	Neglia	RVE
Ability to meet objectives in scope of work, staffing, proposal requirements	25	16.8	20	16.25	18
Experience with implementation of corridor enhancement projects	25	18.6	20.8	16.25	18.75
Familiarity with the Borough of Tenafly	25	18.4	22.4	13.75	16.5
General experience/qualifications	15	13	13.8	11.25	12.25
Fee Structure	10	9	6.8	5.25	10
Average Total	100	75.8	83.8	62.75	75.5